ID:02040affidavitbww

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO **WESTERN DIVISION**

KATHRYN MARSHALL CASE NO. C-1-02-189

VENA MARSHALL

Judge Herman Weber

Plaintiffs

Magistrate Judge Hogan

VS.

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

NEW BOSTON PUBLIC SCHOOLS

LOWELL HOWARD

AFFIDAVIT OF BERNARD W.

WHARTON **BERNARD TILLEY**

MELINDA BURNSIDE

JERRY BENTLEY

LAURA WESSEL

PAT POTTER

Defendants

STATE OF OHIO,

COUNTY OF HAMILTON, SS:

Bernard W. Wharton being first duly sworn, states as follows:

- 1. I am counsel for the defendants in this matter.
- 2. On May 18,2005, I sent to counsel for the plaintiffs', Joseph Bansci,

defendants first set of interrogatories and requests for production of documents propounded to plaintiffs. Copy of that letter is attached as Exhibit A to this Affidavit.

- 3. On June 20,2005, I had not received any response from Mr. Bansci, and sent him a letter on the same date inquiring as to when I might expect his clients' answers to the defendants' discovery requests. A copy of this letter is attached as Exhibit B.
- 4. On or around June 24,2005, I received the hand-written discovery responses from Sandra Marshall as well as several documents. Copy of the hand-written responses are attached at Exhibit C to this affidavit.
- 5. In response to these inadequate responses, I sent a letter on June 24,2005 to Mr. Bansci outlining the problems with his clients responses. A copy of that letter is attached at Exhibit D to this Affidavit.
- 6. I did not receive any response from Mr. Bansci following my letter to him of June 24,2005, and therefore sent letters to Mr. Bansci on July 20,2005, August 25,2005, September 19, 2005 and October 12,2005. Copies of those letters are attached at Exhibits E, F, G. and H. to this Affidavit.
- 7. To date, I have received no response from Mr. Bansci on the issues raised in my numerous letters to him.

FURTHER AFFIANT SAYETH NAUGHT

Sworn to before me in my presence this

Notary Public

Motery Public, State of Ohlo My Commission Expires July 1, 2007

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 18^{th} day of October, 2005, a copy of the foregoing document was filed electronically. Notice of this filing will be sent to all parties by operation of the Court's electronic filing system. Parties may access this filing through the Court's system.

s/ R. Gary Winters

R. Gary Winters 0018680
Bernard W. Wharton 0063487
McCASLIN, IMBUS & McCASLIN
Attorneys for Defendants
Suite 900 Provident Building
632 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202-2442
(513) 421-4646 Telephone
(513) 421-7929 Facsimile
rgwinters@mimlaw.com
bwwharton@mimlaw.com

OF COUNSEL JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION THE PROVIDENT BUILDING 632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

> TELEPHONE (513) 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com

JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

> *ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY **ALSO LICENSED IN INDIANA

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

May 18, 2005

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re:

Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court, Case No. C-1-02-189

Our file: 02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

Enclosed please find Defendants' First Set of Interrogatories and Requests for Production of Documents Propounded to Plaintiffs which we have prepared in this matter. If you would like a copy of these documents forwarded to you electronically, please provide me with your formatting requirements and we will be happy to forward them to you.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/bab ID:020401 bansci 3 Enclosure

EXHIBIT A

OF COUNSEL JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION THE PROVIDENT BUILDING 632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

> TELEPHONE [513] 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com

JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

> *ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY "ALSO LICENSED IN INDIANA

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

June 20, 2005

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re:

Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court

Case No.

C-1-02-189

Our File

02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

I sent your clients a set of Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents on May 18, 2005. The 30-day period for answering those discovery requests has passed. Please let me know when I may expect your client's answers to our discovery requests.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/pjs ID:G:\Phyl\2005 Correspondence\020401 Bansci.wpd

EXHIBIT

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION

EDDIE F. MARSHALL SÁNDRA D. MARSHALL VENA MARSHALL KATHRYN P. MARSHALL CASE NO. C-1-02-189

Judge Herman Weber

Plaintiffs

Magistrate Judge Hogan

VS.

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

NEW BOSTON PUBLIC SCHOOLS

LOWELL HOWARD

BERNARD E. TILLEY, JR.

DEFENDANTS' FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES AND REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS PROPOUNDED TO PLAINTIFFS

MELINDA BURNSIDE

LINDA WESSEL

JERRY BENTLEY

LAURA WESSEL

PATRICIA K. POTTER

Defendants.

Pursuant to Federal Civil Rules 33 and 34, defendants propound the following interrogatories and request for production of documents to plaintiffs. Interrogatories are to be answered fully, in writing and under oath no later than thirty (30) days after the service hereof. Items requested are to be produced at the offices of McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin, Suite 900 Provident Bank Building, 632 Vine Street, Cincinnati, Ohio 45202, not later than thirty (30) days after the service hereof.

& McCaslin A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION 632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

McCaslin, Imbus

If plaintiffs are unable to answer fully any interrogatory, or respond fully to any production request, plaintiffs are to answer or respond with such information as is presently available to them or their attorney.

INTERROGATORIES

1. State the name and address of the person or persons responding these discovery requests.

ANSWER:

Sandra D. Marshall 4308 Sallia Street New Boston, Ohio 45662

740-456-6531 phone

2. State the name and address of each person, known to you, who has knowledge of the facts and/or circumstances set forth in your Complaint and your Amended Complaint.

ANSWER: I don't understand the question fully,
The one person knowledgeable lexides our attorney is:
Mr. Walter Callihan
P.O. Box 17
Argillite, Kentucky 4/121
606-473-5867 phone

3. State the name and address of each person whom you expect to call as an expert witness at the trial of this matter, and for each such expert state the subject matter upon which he or she is expected to testify.

ANSWER: We are undecided to date. Later our attorney will decide for us.

4. State the name and business address of all medical providers who treated any or all plaintiffs have seen as a result of the allegations of the Complaint and Amended Complaint.

ANSWER:

Listing is attached here

MCCASLIN, IMBUS

& MCCASLIN
A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION
632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900

CINCINNATI, OHIC 45202-2442

MEDICAL RECORDS

Dr. Newman 776-2146 Family Physician (2001 to date) 5611 Gallia Street, Sciotoville, Ohio 45662

Dr. Arnette 353-5002 Kathryn, Abbey, Vena, Mom, Matt (2000 to date)

1611 27th Street, Portsmouth, Ohio 45662

Lori Guinn 356-8425 Bldg. "H", up steps,2nd door on left. Vena, Abbey, Matt (2002)

27th Street, SOMC Building "H", Portsmouth, Ohio 45662

Dr. Carver 353-1548 FAX 353-7198 Vena and Kathryn. (2000 - 2002)

500 Chillicothe Street, Suite #306, Portsmouth, Ohio 45662

Shawnee Mental Health Center, Inc. 740-354-1010 For Kathryn only. (2003)

901 Washington Street, Portsmouth, Ohio 45662

Dr. Wasim Deeb 353-7881 Bldg "C" Kathryn only. (2005)

1735 27th Street, Bldg "C", Portsmouth, Ohio 45662

SOMC & Urgent Care, Wheelersburg 740-574-9090 All Family (1997 to date)

8770 Ohio River Road, Wheelersburg, Ohio 45694

St. Anne's Hospital 614-898-4000 Kathryn only. (2002 or 2003)

500 South Cleveland Avenue, Westerville, Ohio 43224

OSU James Cancer Center 614-293-3300 Ed, 1998

300 West 10th Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43212

Dr. Anne Joseph, M.D. 614-722-2000 Kathryn and Vena (2001-2003)

Pediatric Neurology, Children's Hospital, 700 Children's Drive, Columbus, Ohio 43205

Dr Mary Ann Murphy, M.D. 614-221-9922 Vena, (2002-2003)

Department of Psychiatry, East Central -CHGC, 899 East Broad Street,

Columbus, Ohio 43205

Dr. John T. Beetar, PhD. 614-722-4700 Vena, (2002-to date)

Pediatric Neuropsychology, Department of Psychology, Children's Hospital,

700 Chilren's Drive, Columbus, Ohio 43205-2692

State the name and business address of all medical providers who treated any or all of the plaintiffs in the last ten (10) years.

ANSWER:

Same list, attached here.

Please state the specific life activities impaired by Vena Marshall's epilepsy and what medical care provider diagnosed such impairments

1. Produce all documents used in the answering the above interrogatories.

RESPONSE:

Enclosed are the records.

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION 632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442 2. Produce all medical records of plaintiff Vena Marshall.

E: Some are here, some are still being copied, and will arrive to you in about three weeks. RESPONSE:

3. Produce all medical records plaintiff Eddie F. Marshal..

RESPONSE:

The same as #2 above.

Produce all medical records of plaintiff Sandra Marshall. 4.

RESPONSE:

The pame as # 2 above.

5. Produce all medical records of plaintiff, Kathryn Marshall.

RESPONSE:

The same as # 2 allowe.

Produce documents concerning all correspondence you had with New Boston Public School District concerning plaintiff Vena Marshall and plaintiff Kathyrn Marshall.

RESPONSE:

records enclosed.

Produce all documents concerning any IEP for plaintiff Vena Marshall and plaintiff Kathryn Marshall.

RESPONSE:

Records enclosed

McCaslin, IMBUS & McCaslin A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION 632 VINE STREET, SLITE 900 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

Respectfully submitted.

R. Gary Winters

(0018680)

Bernard W. Wharton

(0063487)

Attorney for Defendants

McCASLIN, IMBUS & McCASLIN, LPA

-Cwww

632 Vine Street, Suite 900

Cincinnati, OH 45202-2442

(513) 421-4646

(513) 421-7929 (facsimile)

E-mail: rgwinters@mimlaw.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 18th day of May, 2005, a copy of the foregoing document was served via ordinary mail upon:

Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113 ATTORNEY FOR PLAINTIFFS

R. Gary Winters

(0018680)

Bernard W. Wharton

Clookt

(0063487)

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION 632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900

CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

OF COUNSEL JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, IMBUS & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION
THE PROVIDENT BUILDING
632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

TELEPHONE (513) 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

*ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

June 24, 2005

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re: Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court, Case No. C-1-02-189

Our file: 02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

I have just received a large box directly from your clients that contains some hand-written discovery responses and several binders of documents. There are numerous problems with this.

First, it is not appropriate for your clients to be directly corresponding with me when you represent them. If they wish to properly answer the discovery requests, they should get them to you so you can sign any objections that are raised in the discovery responses and so that you can insure that they have accurately answered the discovery requests. Furthermore, there is no certificate of service from you that accompanies these discovery responses.

Substantively, there are numerous problems with your clients' answers. Taking them in order, the first problem is with the answer to Interrogatory No. 2. Your clients state that they do not understand the question fully and can only identify one person who has knowledge of the facts and/or circumstances set forth in their Complaint and Amended Complaint. Putting aside the fact that they should have at least identified all of the individual parties to this lawsuit, I do not believe that there is only one witness to all of the allegations they have set forth in their Complaint and Amended Complaint. Please have them supplement this interrogatory answer appropriately.

Next, the response to Interrogatory No. 6 does not identify the medical care providers who diagnosed the impairment of the specific life activities listed in your clients' answer. Please have them do so.

Mr. Bansci page 2. June 24, 2005

With respect to Interrogatory No. 7, your clients indicate that they do not understand the question. It is a straightforward question, and please work with your clients to have them understand it. It is our understanding that your clients converted to Judiasm and joined a synagogue in their area. Please have them answer the question as to when that occurred and how it occurred. The bulk of your clients' answer is completely non-responsive.

A final problem with your clients' responses is that they are unverified. Please have your clients execute the proper verification of their interrogatory answers.

I look forward to your response to these issues and the supplemented discovery responses from your client. If you have any questions, please give me a call.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/sh ID:020401 bancsi 4

OF COUNSEL JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION
THE PROVIDENT BUILDING
632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

TELEPHONE (513) 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com

July 20, 2005

JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

*ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY

**ALSO LICENSED IN INDIANA

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re:

Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court, Case No. C-1-02-189

Our file: 02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

I have not heard from you in response to my letter of June 24, 2005 concerning the inadequacy and mistakes in your clients' discovery responses. Please let me know how you plan to address the issues I raised in my previous letter. I do not wish to go to Judge Hogan on this issue if we can work it out extrajudicially. I await your reply.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/sh ID:020401 bancsi 5



OF COUNSEL

JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, IMBUS & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION
THE PROVIDENT BUILDING
632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

TELEPHONE (513) 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com

August 25, 2005

JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

Page 15 of 17

*ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY

**ALSO LICENSED IN INDIANA

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re:

Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court, Case No. C-1-02-189

Our file: 02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

I still have not heard from you in response to my letters of June 24, 2005 and July 20, 2005. If I do not hear from you by the end of August, I will be forced to bring this matter to the Court's attention in a more formal manner. I await your reply.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/sh ID:020401 bancsi 7



OF COUNSEL JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION THE PROVIDENT BUILDING 632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

> TELEPHONE (513) 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com

JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

> *ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY "ALSO LICENSED IN INDIANA

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

September 19, 2005

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re:

Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court, Case No. C-1-02-189

Our file: 02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

Thank you for your telephone call the other day. I would like to set up the depositions of your clients Vena and Kathryn Marshall. We can schedule those to be held after the Court has ruled upon our motion to dismiss.

In the meantime, can you please address the issues in my letters of June 24, July 20 and August 25? I would certainly appreciate it.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/sh ID:010401 bansci 8

EXHIBIT 4

OF COUNSEL JOHN P. CONCANNON

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

A LEGAL PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION
THE PROVIDENT BUILDING
632 VINE STREET, SUITE 900
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202-2442

TELEPHONE (513) 421-4646 TELECOPIER (513) 421-7929 www.mimlaw.com JOHN M. McCASLIN (1889-1986) ROBERT J. IMBUS (1911-1978) JOHN M. McCASLIN, JR. (1920-1991) CLEMENT J. DEMICHELIS (1927-2003)

*ALSO LICENSED IN KENTUCKY

**ALSO LICENSED IN INDIANA

WEST CHESTER OFFICE 7969 CINCINNATI-DAYTON RD. WEST CHESTER, OHIO 45069 TELEPHONE (513) 759-9123 TELECOPIER (513) 759-7688

October 12, 2005

Mr. Joseph Bancsi Lakeside Place, Suite 450 323 West Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44113

Re: Marshall, et al. v. Ohio Dept. of Education, et al.

U.S. District Court, Case No. C-1-02-189

Our file: 02-04-01

Dear Mr. Bancsi:

Can you let me know why you and your clients have not responded to my previous letters on the problems with your clients' discovery responses as outlined in my initial letter of June 24, 2005? If you and your clients believe that these issues are unresolvable, please let me know and I will bring them to the Court's attention.

You will also recall that I gave you permission to extend the deadline line for identifying experts and producing reports, but have not yet seen any such information from you. Please confirm that you will be using no experts in this matter.

Finally, now that Mr. and Mrs. Marshall have been dismissed as parties, I would like to schedule the depositions of Vena and Kathryn Marshall. If I do not hear from you, I will simply notice those depositions. I would like to work together to move this case forward.

Very truly yours,

McCaslin, Imbus & McCaslin

Bernard W. Wharton

BWW/sh ID:020401 bansci 9

EXHIBIT #